

**REPORT TITLE:** ORILLIA PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW – FOLLOW UP REPORT BY STAFF  
**REPORT NUMBER:** 9.2) 15-2009  
**DESTINATION:** Board Meeting #15  
**DATE:** Wednesday, October 14, 2009  
**AUTHOR OF REPORT:** Glenn Clarke, Controller of Plant  
**TYPE OF REPORT:** INFORMATION

---

**PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW AREA:** Foley Catholic School (FOL)  
Guardian Angels School (GAN)  
Monsignor Lee Catholic School (MLE)  
Notre Dame Catholic School (NOD)  
St. Bernard's School (SBE)

**Background:**

1. Staff reported to the Board in June of this year, in response to the Orillia Pupil Accommodation Committee's (PAC) Report to the Director of Education and their Recommendations for Accommodation solutions for the Orillia Area elementary schools.
2. The required Pupil Accommodation Review process has continued and a Board Meeting to receive Public Input was held on October 5, 2009. The meeting was convened at Guardian Angels School in Orillia.
3. This follow up report provides a summary and response to the input received at the October 5, 2009 meeting and also will provide updated information since Staff's report in June.

**Comments:**

4. As noted above, and in compliance with the Board Policy LE-14, a Board Meeting for Public Input on October 5, 2009 was convened at Guardian Angels School in Orillia.
5. At the meeting the following delegations presented to the Board:
  - i. Mardi McLaughlin, Chair of Monsignor Lee School Community Council
  - ii. Fior Tucci, Parent at Monsignor Lee School
  - iii. Jeff Waite, Parent at Monsignor Lee School
6. In addition to the delegates at the meeting, it is important to note that there were over 60 attendees signed in including representation from each of Monsignor Lee, St. Bernard's, Guardian Angels and Notre Dame schools.
7. Attached are the copies of the delegates' written submissions and the draft Minutes of the Meeting (Appendices 1 & 2).
8. The following is a summary of the representations made by the delegates, along with Staff's

response:

- i. Support for Option A for the replacement of MLE and GAN on a new site.
- ii. To ensure fair and equitable facilities for all Orillia Catholic schools
- iii. Review of concerns on existing MLE site including:
  - no sports field
  - unsafe bus and drop off zone
  - limited /insufficient parking – compounded in winter with impact of snow storage
  - dangerous fencing issue
  - school that needs updating
  - concern of having to share field with secondary school
  - congestion of Fitton’s Road and how school driveways interface with road
  - Principal’s office needs improved site lines
- iv. Imperative considerations for either the new or existing site included:
  - Safety
  - Athletics and Recreation
  - School Logistics
  - School Footprint

*Staff Responses to the Delegations*

9. In addition to the consideration of the comments related to the future opportunities for replacement of MLE /GAN there were a number of items raised by the delegates that require attention currently with respect to safety concerns. These will be reviewed by the school staff and the local superintendent.

10. At the PAC, Staff supported the following accommodation options for each of the review area schools:

**Foley (FOL)** should remain status quo for the school building. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school’s boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity.

**Notre Dame (NOD)** should also remain status quo for the school building. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school’s boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity. In addition, consideration should be given to review timing of site acquisition for the future elementary site in West Ridge to meet the growth requirements.

**St. Bernard’s (SBE)** should be replaced with a new school on the existing site. The replacement school should be designed for approximately 300 – 350 pupil places. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school’s boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity.

**Monsignor Lee (MLE) & Guardian Angels (GAN)** should be consolidated in a replacement school either on an alternative site within 1.6 km of the existing two (2) schools (Option A), or on the existing Monsignor Lee school site (Option B) (Partial replacement only, existing MLE gymnasium and office to be retained). Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the schools' boundaries to better balance enrolment and capacity.

11. Attached are copies of the PAC's May 20, 2009 Report to the Director of Education and the June 24, 2009 report to the Board (Appendices 3 & 4).

#### *School Boundaries*

12. The PAC's recommendations include consideration for review of schools' boundaries to balance enrolments.

13. A Boundary Review could be initiated when the timing of the replacement school projects is known. Proceeding with any review of the School Boundaries would be based on our review process, including consultation with the communities of the affected schools, as well as other projects and priorities of the Board.

#### *Capital Funding Considerations*

14. As reported previously, the Ministry of Education advised the Board on June 11 of this year, that \$12.4 million dollars in capital funding has been allocated as *Planning Approval* for the Board's Orillia elementary schools. The Ministry's correspondence states '*the approval to support the elementary accommodation needs in Orillia is a planning approval which recognizes that your Board has a Pupil Accommodation Review Process underway. Our approvals associated with these schools are intended to provide the funding to support the final outcome of the review process, understanding that a final decision has not been made*'. Attached is a copy of the letter from the Ministry (Appendix 5). At this time, it is understood by staff that the financial allocation is a planning approval for a complete Orillia solution, not a partial solution.

15. The capital funding was provided as a Planning Approval for the Catholic elementary schools within the Orillia community. One of the objectives of the Pupil Accommodation Review is to ensure the school facilities can accommodate the needs of the community including fairness with design and standards between MLE/GAN and SBE.

16. The current estimates for the recommended Capital Projects (replacement MLE/GAN (300-

350 pupil places) and replacement SBE (300-350 pupil places)) are in the range of \$16-18 million. These estimates include existing building demolition, site servicing and new building costs for each of the projects. The current estimates for the new building costs only are in the range of \$14-16 million. The new building costs estimates are being reviewed for the 2 replacement projects based on the *Planning Approval* received (\$12.4 million), along with other available funding (e.g Primary Class Size (PCS) capital allocation for the Orillia area (\$1.5 – 2 million)).

17. The estimates for the existing building demolition and site works are also being reviewed. The *Planning Approval* that was received from the Ministry indicated that additional funding could be available related to the costs for building demolitions and/or costs related to site servicing (stormwater, parking lot removal and reinstatement, etc). We are reviewing these components of the 2 replacement projects. This funding opportunity is being reviewed with the Ministry; they remain supportive for additional funds for building demolitions and site servicing as provided in the June 11, 2009 correspondence.

18. Also reviewed with the Ministry is the consideration to use other available funds (Good Places to Learn, Facility Renewal Projects, Proceeds of Disposition) that may support this project. Again, the Ministry generally supports the use of these additional funds for funding the replacement schools.

19. The overall budget needs for the replacement of these 2 school buildings could be supported subject to the analysis being worked on with the project budgets, the Ministry review on Primary Class Size allocations, and additional funding requests as noted above (building demolition, site servicing, Good Places to Learn and Facility Renewal Projects).

#### *Project Design Considerations*

20. An Architect has been selected for the SBE replacement project and preliminary design concepts have been developed. Further consideration will be required on the approach for interim accommodation requirements and how this may impact project design, project costs and timing considerations.

21. A recommendation for appointment of an Architect for the North Orillia replacement project is being considered at the October 14, 2009 Board Meeting. This engagement will provide for consideration of both the MLE / GAN replacement project at the existing Monsignor Lee site or on an alternative site. The reviews being initiated by staff with the Architect will be focussed on addressing the necessary building and site components. Within the PAC's recommendations for this replacement school, building size and site components were identified including the activity area, bus loop, kiss'n'ride and safe pedestrian access. The same site considerations have been raised by the delegates at the October 5 Meeting for Public Input. These priorities for the building and site design will be presented to the Architect in developing the site and building concepts for the replacement school. This approach is similar to other major additions that the Board has completed at existing elementary schools with similar site issues identified (i.e. St. Monica's, Monsignor Clair, Pope John Paul,) and it is expected that the community concerns can be met through viable, effective

design plans.

22. Similar to the replacement project for SBE, further consideration will be required on the approach for interim accommodation requirements and how this may impact project design, project costs and timing considerations. As well, in developing plans for this replacement school project, consideration of the history, culture and identity of both schools will be taken into consideration.

#### *Alternative Site Considerations*

23. As reported in June, there were no funds provided by the Ministry for the acquisition of property that would allow for the replacement of MLE and GAN on an alternative site. Without an available funding source, and a viable alternative, a recommendation of the replacement of the MLE and GAN on an alternative site is not possible at this time.

24. In order to respond to the recommendation of the PAC for the alternative site, a planning consultant was engaged to assist with the review of alternative sites available in the north Orillia area. We also requested the review of the opportunity for additional property adjacent to the existing Monsignor Lee site be considered by the planning consultant. Any consideration of an alternative site or additional property is contingent on Ministry approvals.

25. The engagement with the planning consultant for the site review was based on the following criteria:

- i. Opportunity to achieve additional property to the existing MLE school site;
- ii. Alternative Sites in the North Ward of the City of Orillia to be within 1.6 Km of the existing Monsignor Lee Elementary School site on Fitton's Road and to be on the east and south sides of Hwy 11;
- iii. Status of the Simcoe County District School Board's Elementary and Secondary School Accommodation Reviews and decisions and potential timing related to future school closures and property disposals;
- iv. Consider the Board's Site Designation Policy as well as the standard components required for an elementary school, as well as any requirements of the municipality and their standards.

26. The report from the planning consultant will be provided in private session as it considers property matters. The report considers a number of properties, and based on the work completed to date, there are no alternative sites available that are suitable, based on the defined criteria, including the time constraints.

27. The report of the planning consultant has also considered the Pupil Accommodation Reviews

and related property dispositions of the Simcoe County District School Board (SCDSB). The report indicates that the elementary school properties that have recently been declared surplus and offered for sale do not meet the defined criteria. The report indicates that the SCDSB has made a decision on the Pupil Accommodation Review for the Orillia Secondary Schools, however their decision to consolidate schools is dependent on Ministry funding which has not been allocated to that Board. Therefore the timing and decision on the availability of surplus property from the SCDSB in Orillia is very uncertain.

28. The report of the planning consultant has also considered the opportunity for additional property adjacent the existing Monsignor Lee site and is an interim report pending further analysis of opportunities. The further report will also consider other sites beyond the 1.6 km. walking area.

29. Staff has reviewed the recommendation of the PAC further with the Ministry specifically related to the alternative site option. The Ministry advises that there are no available funds for sites at this time. We are awaiting written confirmation from the Ministry on their comments on site funding. There may be opportunity for funds through proceeds of disposition of the existing site, however, there are concerns that if we are considering the purchase of more acres than we are disposing of there would still not be sufficient funds for an alternative site.

30. With the lack of available site funding, Option A for the MLE / GAN replacement project on an alternative site, cannot be supported at this time. The Ministry has indicated that there are no available capital allocations for sites at this time. We therefore continue to recommend Option B for the MLE / GAN replacement project on the existing MLE site. Alternative site options will continue to be explored in the Orillia area.

### **Summary:**

31. The goals and objectives for the Orillia Catholic Elementary School Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) are to ensure the school facilities can continue to accommodate students effectively while providing equitable programming with a high standard of student learning and in a fiscally responsible manner. This process points to the continued interest in providing better educational facilities for all students in an equitable, open, honest, and fiscally responsible way. The recommendations of the Report of the November 25, 2009 Board Meeting will provide for accommodation options that will serve the Catholic students and families in the Orillia area for years to come.

32. Based on the above information related to available capital funding, the alternative site and related funding, and the Policy LE-14, staff are presenting slightly revised recommendations from those provided in the June 24, 2009 Staff Report. These recommendations will be brought forward to the Board for consideration at the November 25, 2009 Board Meeting. These recommendations are based on the Ministry of Education's Planning Approval and can only be implemented upon the successful completion of the Orillia Catholic Elementary School Pupil Accommodation Review process.

- #1. To maintain the status quo for both Foley Catholic School and Notre Dame Catholic School.
- #2. To replace St. Bernard's school on the existing site. The replacement school will be designed and constructed to accommodate 300-350 pupils.
- #3. To close Guardian Angels and Monsignor Lee and consolidate the 2 schools on the existing Monsignor Lee. The new replacement school will be designed and constructed to accommodate 300-350 pupils. The closure of Guardian Angels will occur at the end of the school year preceding the opening of the replacement school. The closure of Monsignor Lee will occur at the end of the school year preceding the opening of the replacement school.

33. Following the receipt of this report, the Board will consider a decision on the Accommodation Options at the Board Meeting on November 25, 2009.

**Conclusion:**

This report is provided for the information of the Board.